



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 1:

Journal Name:	Ophthalmology Research: An international Journal
Manuscript Number:	2013_OR_4127
Title of the Manuscript:	Retinal astrocytoma: a supportive finding in Tuberous sclerosis-an experience from Nepal

PART 2:

FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to final evaluator's comments
I've revised the last version and appreciate many changes have been made to the manuscript. Nonetheless, I advise to make some other corrections. Particularly, in the introduction (line 20), the sentence " intracranial periventricular or subependymal astrocytomas " is incorrect: the typical lesions found in TSC are subependymal nodules (I.e. Hamartomas), that can degenerate in subependymal giant cell astrocytomas.. <i>Subependymal giant cell astrocytoma develops in 5% to 15% of tuberous sclerosis patients. These tumors most commonly arise from degeneration of subependymal hamartomas at the level of the foramina of Monro (slight right-sided preference)..... intracranial (I imagine that you mean intraparenchymal, subcortical or lobar ones) astrocytomas are a rare degeneration of tubers.</i> Additionally, even though the manuscript has been revised by a native English speaker, the sentence on lines 27-29 is a little confused.. for instance "These astrocytomas are lesions in the retinal..." seems better than "These astrocytoma are THE lesions..." Furthermore, Case 1 line 57 : " consistent with" seems more appropriate than "probably" Finally, In the discussion section, lines 89-90 are difficult to understand.. perhaps you meant the opposite, I mean that being TSC lesions similar to central nervous system dysplasias, retina can be affected as nervous tissue... I think that sentence has to be erased or modified (what does it mean "midcranial morphology"? And How could you justify tumors in the heart and kidneys with this hypothesis?)	We highly respect these suggested advice and we have made all the necessary corrections. The confusion in line 20 has been removed by erasing the word intracranial periventricular or subependymal astrocytomas. Classic intracranial manifestations of tuberous sclerosis include subependymal nodules and cortical/subcortical tubers. So the erased word is replaced with subependymal nodules. The line 27-29 has been corrected and the confusion has been removed. In Case 1 line 57 ,the word probably is replced by "consistent with". Thank you for this valuable suggestion. The cause for multiorgan hamartoma in TSC is the mutation of TSC1 and TSC2 genes. So this line has been added in line 21 in the introduction section and the line 89-90 has been erased.